From: Mark Vincent Healy <markvincenthealy@gmail.com>
Date: Monday 13 March 2023 at 18:26
To: Minister for Education <MINISTER@education.gov.ie>, Norma Foley TD, "Newcombe, Derek", John Moore TUSLA
Cc: An Taoiseach, Leo Varadkar TD, Tánaiste, Micheal Martin TD, "Minister for Communications, Climate Action and Environment", Eamon Ryan TD, Minister for Justice, Helen McEntee TD, Minister for Children & Youth Affairs, Roderic O'Gorman TD, Minister for Finance, Pascal Donohoe TD, Minister for Health, Stephen Donnelly TD, Simon Coveney TD, "President Michael D. Higgins", Michael McGrath TD, Members of the Oireachtas, Barry Andrews MEP, Ciarán Cuffe MEP Clare Daly MEP, Frances Fitzgerald MEP, Luke 'Ming' Flanagan MEP, Chris MacManus MEP, Mairead McGuinness MEP, Maria Walsh MEP, Deirdre Clune MEP, Billy Kelleher MEP, Seán Kelly MEP, Grace O'Sullivan MEP, Mick Wallace MEP, Archbishop Jude Thaddeus Okolo - Papal Nuncio to Ireland, Archbishop Eamon Martin Office - President IEC, Archbishop Dermot Farrell - Vice-President IEC, Archbishop Kieran O'Reilly - Episcopal Secretary IEC, Bishop John Fleming - Finance Secretary IEC, "Fr Martin Kelly, Provincial CSSp - AMRI Chair", Archbishop Diarmuid Martin
Subject: 230313 - Commission to Inquiry into Child Sexual Abuse in Primary and Post-Primary Schools in Ireland

Taoiseach Micheál Martin TD, Reference: DOT-TM-14827-2022
Minister for Education, Norma Foley TD, Reference: DES-CU-04237-2022
Minister for Justice, Helen McEntee TD, Reference: DJE-MO-10586-2022

Emails

221117 - 17 Nov 2022 missive calling for IMMEDIATE INDEPENDENT INQUIRY by Mark Vincent Healy - https://bit.ly/3gjV1vl

230305 - Commission to Inquiry into Child Sexual Abuse in Primary and Post-Primary Schools in Ireland - https://bit.ly/3yd7shL
230306 - Commission to Inquiry into Child Sexual Abuse in Primary and Post-Primary Schools in Ireland - https://bit.ly/3IVloSz
230307 - RTÉ - Minister announces scoping inquiry into historical abuse in schools – Email to Emma O'Kelly et. al. - https://bit.ly/3Law0Qf
230308 - RTÉ - Minister announces scoping inquiry into historical abuse in schools - https://bit.ly/3F7oodA
230309 - Commission to Inquiry into Child Sexual Abuse in Primary and Post-Primary Schools in Ireland - https://bit.ly/3J5vq3y
230310 - Commission to Inquiry into Child Sexual Abuse in Primary and Post-Primary Schools in Ireland - https://bit.ly/3LksSS5
230312 - Commission to Inquiry into Child Sexual Abuse in Primary and Post-Primary Schools in Ireland - https://bit.ly/3ZFPG2F

Documents

TUSLA: 230309 - Notification by Designated Liaison Person (DLP) for Spiritan Fathers to Tusla - https://bit.ly/3l9mDFJ

Monday, 13 March 2023

Dear Minister Foley,

Following my email (https://bit.ly/3ZFPG2F) dated Sunday, 12 March 2023 to you, I have not received an acknowledgement of it, or that of all emails listed above from Sunday, 5 March 2023.

I wrote in reference to TUSLA's involvement stating, "I will be glad to call on Mr John Moore this week as soon as possible to explain the unnecessary risks and suffering caused to survivors through unsolicited contact. He might also need to understand that those who have engaged with him have done so in the belief they are involved in the inquiry proper. The inquiry proper has not been called yet, and had yet to be designed and defined. It is crucial that all contact with survivors is clearly outlined and explained to them. It is important that they are given oversight and clarification of any and all steps and stages. It is not so at this time." There is very clear misunderstanding of what I have stated where any unsolicited contact which may be a cause or lead to a cause of distress must be discontinued. There is clearly no legal powers granted to be a cause of risk to the health and welfare of a survivor.

Establishing a forum of and for survivors is a crucial matter in addressing the obvious concerns that no part of this inquiry into child sexual abuse in schools in Ireland can be said to be a survivor-led inquiry where there is no space for survivors to act collectively in assessing all steps and stages of it, let alone defining and designing the inquiry process to establish the roles played by parties who contributed to the culture which exposed children to such malice and predation, profoundly affecting the lives of those affected.

There are a number of considerations which must and ought to be taken into account when dealing with survivors of child sexual abuse in schools, of primary importance is complete clarity. There is none, where survivors and the general public, are of the opinion that the inquiry proper has commenced, when it clearly has not. It is a situation that is not helped by calling a scoping exercise, a scoping inquiry, or as Tusla terms it as a Minister-initiated Scoping Inquiry. This is further confusing the general public and survivors by using the title

'terms of reference' for the 'scoping inquiry' which also lends to the notion that the national inquiry has commenced proper, when it has not. The appointment of a person to oversee the 'scoping inquiry' is also a misdirect lending itself to the notion of a statutory appointed person with defined statutory powers to carry out a national inquiry and has been appointed with the concomitant legislation in place when there is none at this stage.

No legal provisions have been established for a national inquiry.

Clearly my email of yesterday was discarded, and perhaps by the injury of not even acknowledging it, my sincere and well-founded concerns are being dismissed as an irrelevance in the silence.

It is vital that concerns for the welfare of survivors is not dismissed, just as had their welfare when they were children. Any process that is initiated in dealing with survivors must address the grave experiences of inappropriate policies, procedures and practices of those who preceded them in Redress, from similar or even more extreme experiences and tragic outcomes. I will speak out against repeat failings to address genuine concerns that have a history, a very recent history, of extreme outcomes in failing to plan and consider properly the space of inquiry and survivors of child sexual abuse in schools in Ireland.

Child Sexual Abuse Survivor Death Rates

We know that survivors of redress, over 15,500 of them, were put through a lot in the Redress Scheme that was devised. A large number are now dead. In 2016, eight years ago, a review by Professor Mary Codd recorded an estimated population reduction for male and female survivors of redress, which indicated over a 14 year period, 2002 to 2016, there was a 20.5% reduction in the male survivor population (https://bit.ly/3JAtuBx) and a 15.0% reduction in the female survivor population (https://bit.ly/3LniTLA).

These figures were provided in the 2016 report commissioned by Caranua (https://bit.ly/3LiRmuI), in other words it was paid for out of Redress survivor funds and not the Department of Education who were seeking the information. The estimates were based on the general population decline and not factors which may be a cause of earlier deaths amongst Redress survivors or survivors of child sexual abuse who are believed to have significantly foreshortened lives as a result of their childhood experiences.

What the reduction in the original redress population over 20 years would be significantly higher.

Child Sexual Abuse Survivor Causes of Death and Ages of Death

What is more important is to ask what were the ages and causes of death to redress victims in death certificates or coroner reports? We know suicide rates were particularly high in the survivor population, significantly higher in fact than the general population by a factor of 13. Many of those deaths were during the inquiry period and after reparations had been awarded in many cases.

Information that is nearly 20 years old but little recalled or heeded is a cause of great concern. Following successful applications redress survivors were not out of the woods, remaining particularly vulnerable.

Regrettably, information published in the newspapers gained insufficient traction for a full and proper inquiry into the vulnerabilities facing survivors of child sexual abuse, especially where suicide was concerned. The reports of the death Mr Anthony Delaney (https://bit.ly/3LnnwVY) in April 2005 by drowning in the Liffey, following a call to his solicitor on the Quays, seeking an advance on his settlement which he was refused, is not an atypical experience of redress survivors. This situation was particularly egregious as the

Redress Act provided for an immediate payment of €10,000 on receiving news of a successful award. Mr Delaney was left waiting over two months for any advancement and was still living in sheltered accommodation. In May 2016, his death was followed by further media revelations at the appalling scale of suicide amongst survivors (https://bit.ly/3J6T7Zk) which reported on 57 victims of abuse who had taken their own lives in the five years to 2005. I raised these appalling matters in a protest report issued on the high rates of suicide amongst survivors of child sexual abuse in 2013, https://bit.ly/3mQregM.

Plan to Care not to Apologise for Failures

On 19 May 2005, the concern for survivors of redress drove the Consultant Psychiatrist, of Dún Laoghaire, Dr Michael Corry to pen a most memorable plea for justice and humane treatment and consideration of survivors of redress in his letter to the Minister for Education, Ms Mary Hanafin TD (https://bit.ly/425e9QO). Whilst he sought an abolition of the then Redress Board, I am seeking a retraction of this 'Minister-initiated Scoping Inquiry' in favour of what Dr Michael Corry called for in a 'open forum of survivors' to examine and approve with their chosen experts, experts many of whom Minister Foley has relied on and were contacted by survivors before her office had.

In order to protect survivors of child sexual abuse in schools all planned points of contacts with those survivors must be identified, and the appropriate supports put in place. I explained this point in my email of Sunday, 12 March 2023 (https://bit.ly/3ZFPG2F) where I wrote, "*The whole plan regarding an inquiry, demanded by survivors like myself, has not been provided and outlined, showing all points of contact with survivors of child sexual abuse throughout the inquiry, showing contact for what purpose, showing contact with what safeguards, and showing contact for what duration.*"

There will be no repeat of the distress levels caused survivors of child sexual abuse in the past, in lessons learnt from the fiasco which led to unacceptable high levels of suicide, additional excruciating levels of retriggering trauma and distress, and further isolation of survivors from their own forum to review their collectively supported needs and wants by fellow survivors.

I am appealing to your humanity to do the right thing here and err on the side of caution at least before some tragedy occurs which was clearly avoidable and preventable.
Please call a halt to this 'scoping exercise' till survivors who might be called to a forum can review and support any and all steps and stages proposed by the Department of Education largely responsible for the considerable high level of child sexual abuse in schools in Ireland over 70 years.

Yours sincerely,

Mark-Vincent Healy



Mark-Vincent Healy
Marc Uinseann ÓhÉalaighthe

Survivor Campaigner seeking 'Rescue Services' and 'Safe Space Provisioning' for survivors of clerical child sexual abuse
Founder of Council of Survivors | Member of RISN | Member of ECA
Campaigner for Justice for Survivors of Child Sexual Abuse in Day Schools In Ireland and the European Parliament
Negotiator for Residential Institutional Survivor Consultation Talks with the Department of Education
Assistant and negotiator to many legal case closures and settlements

Email: markvincenthealy@gmail.com
Mobile: +353-87-6374006
Articles: http://www.thejournal.ie/author/mark-vincent-healy/
http://ncronline.org/person/mark-vincent-healy

Report on C.S.Sp. by Mark Vincent Healy https://bit.ly/2Oobdhj - 120904
Pope's Visit in August 2018 – CNN | Al Jazeera | Washington Post | BBC | ABC Australia | CTA Canada | NCR | Deutche Welle | Irish Independent | Irish Times | Irish Examiner | BishopsAccountability.org | Rete L'Abuso Italy | etc